


CLAYTON COUNTY BENCHMARKING REPORT

Prepared for Clayton County, GA Central Services

January, 2022

A decorative graphic consisting of several parallel blue lines of varying thicknesses, extending diagonally from the bottom left towards the top right of the page.

235 Peachtree Street, NW
Suite 400
Atlanta, Georgia 30303
404-584-9777 phone
404-584-9730 fax

This report contains Griffin & Strong, P.C.'s (GSPC) deliverable, as required in Task Two of Clayton County PSA #21-60 benchmarking services, specifically:

- Develop and implement methodology for benchmarking of MWBE for semi-annual reporting.
 - Set new benchmark based on 3-year dollars Utilization percentages for MBEs and WBEs.
 - Draft SOP for semi-annual benchmarking

Deliverable: Report of disparity study benchmark, current benchmark, and SOP for setting semi-annual benchmarking.

It must be noted that it is GSPC's strong recommendation that Clayton County conduct a new disparity study to obtain more recent historical data and analyses of its relevant market and Availability of firms. Deliverables should include access to underlying data for the study, accessible for future benchmarking use. As standard practice, and in preparation for any future study, Clayton County should take steps to ensure that all subcontractor Utilization is reported, including non-minority subcontractors as well as minority and woman owned firms.

I. REPORT OF 2019 DISPARITY STUDY BENCHMARKS

GSPC's deliverable for Task One of this engaged consulting included tables containing, among other data, Clayton County's prime and subcontractor Utilization of minority- and woman-owned businesses for Fiscal Year 2020 and comparisons of Utilization of such businesses over said one-year period to Utilization reported in Clayton County's most recent study, dated October 2019. The Task One report will be submitted with this report to easily refer to the data discussed herein. . Acronyms and abbreviations appearing in this document include the following with meanings as described below:

- DBE:** Disadvantaged Business Enterprise(s)
- FY:** Fiscal Year(s)
- MBE:** Minority-Owned Business Enterprise(s)
- MSA:** Metropolitan Statistical Area
- MWBE:** Minority Business Enterprise(s) and Woman-Owned Business Enterprise(s)
- SLBE:** Small Local Business Enterprise(s)
- SOP:** Standard Operating Procedures
- WBE:** Woman-Owned Business Enterprise(s)

Utilization of MBEs and WBEs reported in the 2020 study reflected awards from FY2017-2019. It has been almost ten years since the County's last disparity study (2011). Given the age of the data from the previous disparity study, lack of MBE and WBE Availability data for

the FY2017-2019 and FY2020 analyses, differences in award categories, and lack of access to other data underpinning the previous study, GSPC can only recommend reliance on these comparisons as informational, but not actionable. In addition, GSPC conducted a total Utilization analysis by combining prime contract dollars with subcontract dollars after subtracting subcontract dollars from prime contract dollars on a contract-by-contract basis for the FY2020 analysis. For this reason, a few observations of interest are noted for this report.

- In Construction, MWBE total Utilization appeared to increase from 21.80% to 53.60%. The FY2020 total Utilization of 53.60% comprised of 13.07% MBE and 39.99% Non-Minority Woman owned firms, which made up most of the increase.
- In Architecture and Engineering, MWBE total Utilization appeared to decrease from 28.80% to 1.82%. The FY2020 Utilization of 1.82% only comprised of 0.97% MBE and 0.85% Non-Minority Woman owned firms.
- In Professional Services, MWBE total Utilization appeared to decrease from 10.47% to 6.52%. The FY2020 total Utilization of 6.52% comprised of 1.85% MBE and 4.66% Non-Minority Woman owned firms.
- In Other Services, MWBE total Utilization appeared to increase from 6.56% to 27.32%. The FY2020 Utilization of 27.32% comprised of 5.53% MBE and 21.80% Non-Minority Woman owned firms.
- In Goods & Supplies, MWBE total Utilization appeared to increase from 5.02% to 11.15%. The FY2020 Utilization of 11.15% comprised of 10.26% MBE and 0.89% Non-Minority Woman owned firms.

II. BENCHMARKS ASSOCIATED WITH FY2020 UTILIZATION DATA

The Clayton County Central Services SOP, version 6.06.13, provides instructions for establishing benchmarks. To the extent possible, the current SOP's instructions for benchmarking will be followed as a baseline; however, in Section III below, GSPC will provide recommendations for revisions to the SOP for benchmarking.

As previously noted, Clayton County's most recent disparity study was issued ten years ago and is not a reliable source of current or recent Availability data needed for benchmarking. Accordingly, GSPC sought another reliable source of current or recent Availability data. The team selected the 2018 Fulton County Disparity Study, which was conducted by GSPC and reviewed data from 2012-2016. Factors included in selection of the Fulton County Disparity Study for this exercise included, but were not limited to:

1. Fulton and Clayton Counties are contiguous and part of the same MSA;
2. Confidence in the Master Vendor File and methodology utilized for determining Availability;

3. Confidence in the methodology used for determining the relevant market for each procurement category, including use of criteria that meet or exceed best practices; and
4. Similarity in types of services typically provided by county governments and ability to match procurement categories.

Due to the relative size of the two contiguous counties and their placement in the same MSA, the GSPC team believes the firms available to Fulton County are available to Clayton County. Comparing Clayton County’s Utilization from FY2020 to Fulton County’s Availability yielded the theoretical estimates from which to develop benchmarks, whereby following the methodology used in the FY2017 – 2019 analysis.

A. Table 1: Construction Availability

Race/Ethnicity	Total Utilization (Percentage of Total Award Dollars 2020)	Availability (Number of Firms, per Fulton Co. Study)	Availability Percentage
African American	0.07%	684	29.34%
Asian American	-	35	1.50%
Hispanic American	13.00%	76	3.26%
Native American	-	14	0.60%
Total MBE	13.07%	809	34.71%
Non-Minority Woman	39.99%	267	11.45%
Unidentified MWBE/DBE	-	5	0.21%
Total MWBE/DBE	53.07%	1081	46.37%
Non-Minority	46.94%	1250	53.63%
Total	100.00%	2331	100.00%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

B. Table 2: Architecture & Engineering Availability

Race/Ethnicity	Total Utilization (Percentage of Total Award Dollars 2020)	Availability (Number of Firms, per Fulton Co. Study)	Availability Percentage
African American	0.50%	110	29.57%
Asian American	--	12	3.23%
Hispanic American	0.47%	9	2.42%
Native American	--	1	0.27%
Total MBE	0.97%	132	35.48%
Non-Minority Woman	0.85%	51	13.71%
Unidentified MWBE/DBE	--	2	0.54%
Total MWBE/DBE	1.82%	185	49.73%
Non-Minority	98.18%	187	50.27%
Total	100.00%	372	100.00%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

C. Table 3: Professional Services Availability

Race/Ethnicity	Total Utilization (Percentage of Total Award Dollars 2020)	Availability (Number of Firms, per Fulton Co. Study)	Availability Percentage
African American	1.85%	136	14.96%
Asian American	--	9	0.99%
Hispanic American	--	7	0.77%
Native American	--	1	0.11%
Total MBE	1.85%	153	16.83%
Non-Minority Woman	4.66%	31	3.41%
Unidentified MWBE/DBE	--	2	0.22%
Total MWBE/DBE	6.52%	186	20.46%
Non-Minority	93.48%	723	79.54%
Total	100.00%	909	100.00%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

D. Table 4: Other Services Availability

Race/Ethnicity	Total Utilization (Percentage of Total Award Dollars 2020)	Availability (Number of Firms, per Fulton Co. Study)	Availability Percentage
African American	5.34%	533	9.75%
Asian American	--	54	0.99%
Hispanic American	0.18%	36	0.66%
Native American	--	5	0.09%
Total MBE	5.53%	628	11.49%
Non-Minority Woman	21.80%	143	2.62%
Unidentified MWBE/DBE	--	8	0.15%
Total MWBE/DBE	27.32%	779	14.26%
Non-Minority	72.68%	4685	85.74%
Total	100.00%	5464	100.00%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

E. Table 5: Goods & Supplies Availability

Race/Ethnicity	Total Utilization (Percentage of Total Award Dollars 2020)	Availability (Number of Firms, per Fulton Co. Study)	Availability Percentage
African American	4.36%	110	29.57%
Asian American	--	12	3.23%
Hispanic American	5.90%	9	2.42%
Native American	--	1	0.27%
Total MBE	10.26%	132	35.48%
Non-Minority Woman	0.89%	51	13.71%
Unidentified MWBE/DBE	--	2	0.54%
Total MWBE/DBE	11.15%	185	49.73%
Non-Minority	88.85%	187	50.27%
Total	100.00%	372	100.00%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

GSPC recommends setting initial benchmarks for each purchasing category based on the Availability percentages derived in the preceding charts. The average derived from combining the Clayton County Utilization percentages for FY2020 with the Fulton County Availability percentages (add, then divide by 2) should be used as the benchmark, provided the Utilization measure does not exceed the Availability measure. If Utilization exceeds or equals Availability, then the benchmark should be Availability. Applying this methodology, MWBE benchmarks for each category are proposed below:

Table 6

Construction	Total Utilization	Availability	Benchmark
Total MBE	13.07%	34.71%	23.89%
Non-Minority Woman	39.99%	11.45%	11.45%
Unidentified MWBE	0.00%	0.21%	0.11%
Total MWBE/DBE	53.06%	46.37%	46.37%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

Table 7

Architecture & Engineering	Total Utilization	Availability	Benchmark
Total MBE	0.97%	35.48%	18.23%
Non-Minority Woman	0.85%	13.71%	7.28%
Unidentified MWBE	0.00%	0.54%	0.27%
Total MWBE/DBE	1.82%	49.73%	25.78%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

CLAYTON COUNTY BENCHMARKING REPORT

Table 8

Professional Services	Total Utilization	Availability	Benchmark
Total MBE	1.85%	16.83%	9.34%
Non-Minority Woman	4.66%	3.41%	3.41%
Unidentified MWBE	0.00%	0.22%	0.11%
Total MWBE/DBE	6.52%	20.46%	13.49%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

Table 9

Other Services	Total Utilization	Availability	Benchmark
Total MBE	5.53%	11.49%	8.51%
Non-Minority Woman	21.80%	2.62%	2.62%
Unidentified MWBE	0.00%	0.15%	0.08%
Total MWBE/DBE	27.32%	14.26%	14.26%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

Table 10

Goods & Supplies	Total Utilization	Availability	Benchmark
Total MBE	10.26%	10.04%	10.04%
Non-Minority Woman	0.89%	3.33%	2.11%
Unidentified MWBE	0.00%	0.06%	0.03%
Total MWBE/DBE	11.15%	13.42%	12.29%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

II.2. COMPARISON OF PREVIOUS AND CURRENT BENCHMARKS.

GSPC compared the previous benchmarks conducted during FY2017-2019 to the current benchmarks from FY2020 study with respect to the five work categories used throughout the study.

Table 11

Construction	Previous Benchmark	Current Benchmark	Utilization Difference
Total MBE	18.57%	23.89%	5.32%
Non-Minority Woman	10.53%	11.45%	0.92%
Total MWBE/DBE	29.10%	46.37%	17.27%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

CLAYTON COUNTY BENCHMARKING REPORT

Table 12

Architecture & Engineering	Previous Benchmark	Current Benchmark	Utilization Difference
Total MBE	18.26%	18.23%	-0.04%
Non-Minority Woman	13.71%	7.28%	-6.43%
Total MWBE/DBE	31.97%	25.78%	-6.19%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

Table 13

Professional Services	Previous Benchmark	Current Benchmark	Utilization Difference
Total MBE	11.25%	9.34%	-1.91%
Non-Minority Woman	3.41%	3.41%	0.00%
Total MWBE/DBE	14.66%	13.49%	-1.17%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

Table 14

Other Services	Previous Benchmark	Current Benchmark	Utilization Difference
Total MBE	6.88%	8.51%	1.63%
Non-Minority Woman	2.30%	2.62%	0.32%
Total MWBE/DBE	9.18%	14.26%	5.08%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022

Table 15

Goods & Supplies	Previous Benchmark	Current Benchmark	Utilization Difference
Total MBE	6.80%	10.04%	3.24%
Non-Minority Woman	2.37%	2.11%	-0.26%
Total MWBE/DBE	9.17%	12.29%	3.12%

Griffin & Strong, P.C. 2022